DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 235 239 TM 830 667

AUTHOR Wheeler, George; And Others
TITLE An Evaluation of a Bilingual Program with Bilingual Paraprofessionals Serving as the Primary Instructional Personnel, 1982-83.
INSTITUTION Educational Research and Consulting Associates, Portales, NM.
PUB DATE 83
NOTE 23p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Asian Americans; *Bilingual Education Programs; Bilingual Students; Classroom Observation Techniques; Elementary Education; *Paraprofessional School Personnel; Pretests Posttests; Program Effectiveness; *Program Evaluation; *Spanish Speaking; *Statistical Analysis
IDENTIFIERS Bilingual Education Act Title VII 1968; Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills; Language Assessment Scales (De Avila and Duncan)

ABSTRACT

An external evaluation of the Title VII Bilingual Education Project was designed to: (1) gather a subjective assessment from personnel working with the project; (2) observe classroom teaching and activities utilized in bilingual instruction; and (3) to measure differences in levels of achievement on the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills (CTBS) between pre- and post-tests and to measure language proficiency on the Language Assessment Scale (LAS) between pre- and post-tests. There is general agreement that the project is operating more smoothly and effectively than during the previous two years. The instructional objectives and the use of English, Spanish and/or Southeast Asian languages are being met. Pre- and post-test comparisons of the CTBS and the LAS reveal the treatment had significant impact on language skills, on reading readiness, and on developing communicative skills in both Spanish and English. The English portion of the LAS revealed progress between pre- and post-testing in language for Southeast Asian participants. They were not administered a language proficiency test in their home language. Although the Southeast Asian students progressed in English, it was decided that their level of proficiency in English was less than adequate for testing with the CTBS. (Author)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED235239

EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH AND CONSULTING ASSOCIATES

George Wheeler, Ph.D.
Anthony B. Schroeder, Ph.D.
Candido Tafoya, M.A.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

G. Wheeler

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

An Evaluation of a Bilingual Program with Bilingual Paraprofessionals Serving as the Primary Instructional Personnel 1982-83

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

TM 830 667

Abstract

An external evaluation of the Title VII Bilingual Education Project was designed to: (1) gather a subjective assessment from personnel working with the project; (2) observe classroom teaching and activities utilized in bilingual instruction; and (3) to measure differences in levels of achievement on the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills between pre and post tests and to measure language proficiency on the Language Assessment Scale between pre and post tests. There is general agreement that the project is operating more smoothly and effectively than during the previous two years. The instructional objectives and the use of English, Spanish and/or Southeast Asian languages are being met. Pre and post test comparisons of the CTBS and the LAS reveal the treatment had significant impact on language skills, on reading readiness, and on developing communicative skills in both Spanish and English. The English portion of the LAS revealed progress between pre and post testing in language for Southeast Asian participants. They were not administered a language proficiency test in their home language. Although the Southeast Asian students progressed in English, it was decided that their level of proficiency in English was less than adequate for testing with the CTBS. Recommendations on testing, staff training, staffing, etc. are included in the evaluation.

Section 1

Description of Project

Introduction

This report describes the external evaluation of the Title VII Bilingual Education Program of the Clovis Municipal Schools. The elementary schools involved are: James Bickley, Lincoln-Jackson, Our Lady of Guadalupe, and Sacred Heart.

The report covers the period from January 1983 to May 1983. Participants in the project include approximately one hundred sixty-five selected students, grades K-3 or K-6 in four elementary schools.

Purpose and Goal of Project

Purpose

To offer bilingual instruction to selected participants, grades K-6, in four elementary schools. English was the medium of instruction combined with the home language of the participants.

Goal

To offer a program designed to meet the linguistic, cognitive, and affective needs of the participants.

Subjects, Populations, Instructional Objectives,
and Grade Levels of the Bilingual Programs

1. Subject: Spanish as a Second Language (SSL).

   Population: Students of Hispanic background who score 3 or below on the Language Assessment Scale I (LAS): Grade levels K-1.

   Instructional Objective: By the end of the 1983 school year, 30% of the students in grades K-6 will increase their Spanish oral language score by one level, as measured by the LAS I.

2. Subject: Spanish Language Arts

   Population: Spanish-speaking students at Our Lady of Guadalupe Schools: Grade levels K-3.

   Instructional Objectives: By the end of the 1983 school year 80% of the students in grades K-3 will increase their Spanish oral language score by one level, as measured by the Las I. Teacher-made criterion referenced tests for the evaluation sections of the SCDC Spanish Language Arts materials will also be used to determine progress.

3. Subject: English as a Second Language

   Population: Spanish speaking and Southeast Asian LAU A and B students in the four elementary schools: Grade levels K-6.

   Instructional Objective: By the end of the 1983 school year 25% of the students will improve their English oral language usage by one level, as measured by the Language

Assessment Scale.

4. Subject: Community Involvement

   Population: Parents of all identified students and other interested persons. Grade levels: Parents and other persons interested in K-6 students.

   Instructional Objective: Throughout the 1983 school year the community of Clovis will participate in the Title VII Bilingual Program in several ways such as: regularly scheduled meetings of the Parent Advisory Committee, parent evaluation of the curriculum plan and curriculum materials, school visitation by parents and other interested individuals, public participation in school Open House, bicultural student activities, in-service for parents.

5. Subject: Training Component

   Population: Title VII Staff

   Instructional Objectives: All aides will be familiar with techniques in ESL, modified language arts, and use of the dual language approach. All sides will have an understanding of principles and philosophy of bilingual education. Each Title VII staff member will attend one or more workshops on ESL, SSL, modified language arts, and use of the dual language approach.

Section II

Observation Process and Method

An external evaluation was conducted by Educational Research and Consulting Associates. ERCA is staffed by three college professors from New Mexico with expertise in the areas of bilingual education, elementary education, second language instruction, and statistical analyses.

Components of Evaluation

1. On-site visits to conduct interviews with program staff and students for their subjective comments about the bilingual program. The intent of the questions about the bilingual program was to gather information which would reveal perceived strengths and weaknesses. Questions, such as the following, were asked:
   A. What are the strengths of the bilingual program?
   B. What are the weaknesses of the bilingual program?
   C. In general, what are your feelings about the bilingual program?
   D. What are your recommendations to improve the program?
2. On-site visits to observe instruction in bilingual education classes. The evaluator observed the (1) classroom atmosphere, (2) use of multicultural bulletin boards, (3) use of audio-visual materials, (4) creativity, (5) classroom control, (6) materials available, (7) use of these materials, (8) participation of children, (9) evidence of learning demonstrated by

the use of Spanish with emphasis on vocabulary and pronunciation, (10) use of lesson plans, (11) working relationship of the teacher and aide, (12) evidence of ESL instruction.

3. Presentation from statistical analysis of the test scores on the Comprehensive Test of Basic Skills and the Language Assessment Scales. The statistical test will utilize the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS). The analysis included (1) basic descriptive statistics and (2) t-tests to measure differences.

4. Evaluation Reports

   a. There was on-going dialogue between evaluators and the program director in the forms of written comments, telephone conversations, and personal conferences.

   b. The final evaluation report was submitted to the program director in September 1983.

Section III

Evaluation

The external evaluation was designed to (1) gather a subjective assessment from personnel working with the program; (2) observe classroom teaching and activities utilized in bilingual instruction; (3) to measure differences in levels of achievement on the CTBS between pre and post tests and to measure language proficiency on the LAS between pre and post tests.

This section will begin with a summary report of visits to the four elementary schools in the program. The visits were conducted during the spring of 1983. The second section will present the Bilingual Program and the third will present the data analyses.

Summary Report of the Subjective Assessment of the Bilingual Program

One evaluator visited all of the project elementary schools at least two times. During the visits the evaluator discussed the program with staff members and with some of the selected student participants.

There appeared to ge a general agreement that the program operated more smoothly and effectively than it did during the previous school year. There is an obvious need for the program for helping each limited English speaking student. Differences in language proficiency and cognitive development were addressed at the level of need of the individual student. The length of the time of instruction, class enrollment, and the frequency of classes varied among grades and schools.

Class settings and schedules were flexible by design. Instruction ranged from individual or small group to entire classes. Facilities ranged from regular classrooms to partitioned workrooms or vacated offices. Staff members and students appeared to adapt to the class settings, instructional periods, and the time of day of the classes with no difficulty. Supplies and materials were readily available if requested. Pre-service, in-service, and out-of-town conferences were well received.

In conclusion the program instructional objectives are being met in that students identified as limited English speaking, whether Hispanic or Southeast Asian, are being taught English-as-a-second language, some content courses in the home language, the home language as a second language where appropriate, and concepts are explained in either language as needed.

On-site evaluation of the bilingual program in the Clovis Schools

This evaluation covers three on-site visits to five elementary schools. Schools visited during this period were La Casita, Our Lady of Guadalupe, Lincoln-Jackson, Sacred Heart, and James Bickley.

Visits and observations of these schools were conducted on May 5, May 17, and May 18, 1983. Levels observed ranged from kindergarten through K-6. Two schools, James Bickley and Sacred Heart, are involved in a program utilizing Lao as the target language but with the main emphasis being the learning of English. At La Casita the program is also English as a Second Language using Bilingual Education as a vehicle. This is being conducted on a one to one basis. At Lincoln-Jackson the aide works with three or less students at a time, mostly tutoring in English in the areas recommended by each individual teacher. Students being tutored are directly from Mexico. At present eleven students are involved in this program.

Our Lady of Guadalupe is continuing to upgrade its program, and the general atmosphere of the classroom reflects much interest and preparation by the aide. Even at the kindergarten level, the children are able to express themselves in two languages, English and Spanish. In addition to the identification of foods, they are able to expand, using plural forms and short phrases. The bulletin boards are very attractive and conducive to learning. Some of the displays observed were desfile de alfabeto, calendario con los meses en inglés y español.

All schools visited have an ample supply of materials to work with. At Lincoln-Jackson the aide is using Superscope Storyteller. The lesson observed on May 18 involved two third graders and one fourth grader listening to a story on tape using earphones. Stories covered during this session were "David and Goliath" and "Rumpelstiltskin." The three children observed are enjoying the stories, and there is evidence of learning. Other materials available at this school are Distar, SRA, Tutorette Audiocards Systems, and ABC Bingo.

The aide observed at La Casita is utilizing the Distar Language Instructional System in the identification of objects, foods, and animals. The aide asks each child to identify such things as ball, boy, car, apple, etc. The child answers using complete sentences (This is a car, etc.) The aide states that she feels more comfortable in her own room. She is presently working with six students on a one to one basis.

James Bickley is making use of the Hoffman Reading Machine. Other materials available at this school are Essential Sight Words Programs, Distar Language I, and Vowel-Consonant Chart. All personnel at this school are very interested in the Laotian children, and there is evidence of improvement in the performance of these students.

At Sacred Heart the aide is presently tutoring two students in English, using Lao to clarify only. Tutoring is at the first and second grade levels. Materials being used are picture cards, word cards, and worksheets on phonics. A reader titled Daisy Days,

Basics in Reading is being used by the second grader. The aide stated that she has adequate materials to work with. She is also able to obtain any additional materials she needs.

It is recommended that all aides continue in-service training and workshops in order to improve their teaching techniques. Although the supply of teaching materials is very adequate, the aides need to use better follow-up methods in their instruction.

All personnel during this evaluation have been very helpful and receptive. All are very interested in the program and its future success. Communication between all personnel seems to have improved since the last evaluation. It would be advisable that the present program continue to be closely supervised and evaluated on a regular basis.

Statistical Analysis of the Data

The statistical analysis revealed a significant t-score on both the English and Spanish tests using the Language Assessment Scales (LAS) for the kindergarten at Our Lady of Guadalupe. The t-score was $t(22) = 5.30, p < .001$ on the pre and post test for English. The mean on the pre test was 2.73 and the mean on the post test was 4.40. The t-score was $t(22) = 5.45, p < .001$ on the pre and post test for Spanish. The mean on the pre test was 0 while the mean on the post test was 1.

The statistical analysis of the CTBS scores for kindergarten resulted in a t-score of $t(20) = 5.64$, $p < .001$. The mean on the pre test was 24.62 while the mean on the post test was 55.33.

The first grade LAS scores for English produced a t-score of $t(23) = 2.11, p < .02$. The pre test mean was 4.09 and the post test mean was 4.54. The Spanish scores were not significant at the conventional $p < .05$ level of significance. The Spanish t-score was $t(23) = 1.27, p < .10$. The mean at the start of the school year was .95 while the mean at the close of the academic year was 1.25.

The first grade CTBS revealed a significant improvement, $t(21) = 3.60, p < .001$. The mean on the pre test was 19.27. The mean on the post test was 38.36.

The LAS scores for the second grade at Our Lady of Guadalupe in English indicate a significant improvement, $t(26) = 3.31, p < .002$. The mean on the pre test was 4.40 while on the post test 5.0. The t-score for Spanish was $t(26) = 3.08, p < .002$. The pre test mean was 1.33 and the post test mean was 2.11.

The analysis of the CTBS scores revealed $t(17) = 4.47, p < .001$. The pre test mean for the second grade was 26.05. The mean on the post test was 50.40.

The analysis of the Language Assessment Scales for third graders at Our Lady of Guadalupe indicated that a significant difference does not exist between the pre and post test scores for the third grade in English $t(23) = 1.44, p < .07$. The mean for the pre test was 4.91. The mean on the post test was 5.0. Since 5.0 is the maximum that can be scored on the LAS test, this lack of significance is due to the already high pre test score. The Spanish score $t(21) = 2.48, p < .01$ with a pre score of 2.32 and post of 1.86.

The third graders scored 24.66 on the pre test of the CTBS and 45.70 on the post test. The t-score was $t(23) = 4.69, p < .001$.

The analysis of the Lincoln-Jackson scores will be for the bilingual participants selected from the entire school. The t-score on the LAS English test was $t(13) = 5.66, p < .001$. The over mean was .71 on the pre test and 1.93 on the post test. The mean of the pre test scores for the kindergarten was .25 with a post mean of 1.75. The mean of the pre test scores for the first grade was 1.33 while the post mean was 2.0. The second grade mean on the pre test was 1.0 and the mean at the end of the year was 2.0. Third graders averaged .66 on the English test at the beginning of the year and scored 1.66 on the post test. The statistical analysis of the Spanish scores revealed a $t(10) = 3.13, p < .005$. The mean score for kindergarten students was 1.0 on the pre test. The post test scores

for the kindergarten students was 1.25. The first grade average is 2.0 on the pre test and 2.66 on the post test. The mean for the second grade did not change; the pre and post test mean was 2.0. The third grade mean on the pre test was 1.5 with 3.0 on the post test.

Therefore, it appears logical to conclude that the Bilingual Education Program had a statistically significant impact on language skills, on reading readiness, and on developing communicative skills in both English and Spanish.

The next section of the statistical analysis will focus on the Bilingual Education Program for the Southeast Asian children. Two schools are involved in the Program: James Bickley and Sacred Heart. The statistical analysis on the LAS English test revealed $t(18) = 2.35$, $p < .01$. The mean for kindergarteners was .50 at the beginning of the year. The mean for the post test is 1.0. The first graders average .57 on the pre test and 1.42 on the post test. The fifth and sixth graders generally score 5 on the LAS which is the highest score possible. The post mean for fourth graders was 2.33, fifth graders was 5.0, and sixth graders was 3.0. The t-score for Sacred Heart was $t(2) = 4.01$, $p < .02$ on the LAS English test.

The Language Assessment Scale was not used to evaluate their native language skills. Therefore the analysis presented only the results on the English test. Again it is possible to conclude that the Bilingual Education Program has had a significant impact in language training and development.

It should be noted that the participants in grades K-3 at Our Lady of Guadalupe School were pre and post tested on the CTBS and the Spanish and English sections of the LAS. Spanish speaking students at Lincoln-Jackson were pre and post tested on both sections of the LAS, but were not pre and post tested on the CTBS. The Southeast Asian students were not given the CTBS tests. They were given the English portion of the LAS but were not tested for proficiency or progress in their home language. The inconsistencies in test results among and between schools and participants are due to lack of raw scores.

Discussion of Results

The statistical analysis of the data documents that the Bilingual Education Program for the Spanish and Southeast Asian children was successful. The significant statistical differences in all of the classes indicate that the activities within the Bilingual Program, the teachers, and the aides have been successful in developing communicative skills for Spanish speaking children. The results for the Southeast Asian children, although statistically significant, do not show a measureable improvement considering that 1.0 on the LAS test is equivalent to being nonfunctional in English.

Members of the Board of Education of the Clovis Municipal Schools, the School Administrative personnel, the Bilingual Project Director, staff members involved in the program, as well as individual and group lay persons, are to be commended for their efforts in supporting a program designed to help students linguistically, cognitively, and affectively.

Problems of school associated with language culture and values are not quickly and easily overcome. A second transitional bilingual program with a strong ESL component which addresses the needs of the students is a worthwhile endeavor for all concerned.

Conclusion

Persons involved with the Bilingual Program are to be commended for their efforts in attempting to meet the needs of the individual student participants.

Students whose home language is other than English can't be expected to master the English language overnight and simultaneously perform at grade level on standardized achievement tests in English. They can, however, make progress in both areas if instruction is given by dedicated and well trained personnel on a regularly scheduled basis. The project specifies that instruction must be given by paraprofessionals. For this reason a rigorous hiring process for paraprofessionals followed by a strong pre-service and in-service staff training component should be followed by careful and regularly scheduled observations of paraprofessionals by administrators. In most instances, the progress students make in language profeciency and content competencies will be no better than the quality and quantity of instruction they receive.

Recommendations

1. Pre and post test all participants during regularly scheduled testing sessions or when students enter or exit the program.
2. Hire well trained, dedicated teachers who hold New Mexico Bilingual certification to work with students whose home language is Spanish.
3. Administrators should conduct more monitoring visits.
4. Conduct more intensive staff training in academic areas (i.e., bilingual materials purchased for and developed within the program).
5. Hold bilingual seminar for teachers involved in the bilingual program focusing on objects of the program and cultural appreciation.
6. Continue training of aides in Spanish and Laotian with emphasis on vocabulary development, reading, and writing.
7. Continue to offer English as a Second Language to Southeast Asian groups.
8. More use of Spanish by the regular classroom teacher involving the aide.
9. Develop a pool of aide applicants. This may help in future employee selection process.
10. Improve lesson plans so that the bilingual component has a greater or closer relationship to the daily class content.
11. Encourage greater involvement of parents in the program.

References

Askins, B. E. A School and Home Based Bilingual Education Model: Fifth Year Evaluation Study, Lubbock, Texas, 1980.

DeAvila, E. A. and Duncan, S. LAS: Language Assessment Scales. Linguametrics Group, 1975.

Dixon, W. J. and Massey, Jr., F. J. Introduction to Statistical Analysis (Third Edition) New York: McGraw-Hill, 1969.

Morris, L. L. and Fite-Gibbon, C. T. How to Measure Achievement.

Nie, N. H.; Hull, C. H.; Jenkins, J. G.; Steinbrenner, K.; Bent, D. H. Statistical Package for the Social Sciences. (Second Edition) New York: McGraw-Hill, 1975.

Nie, H. and Hull, C. H. SPSS Update. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1979.

Pifer, A. Bilingual Education and the Hispanic Challenge. Reprint

Schroeder, A. B., Tafoya, C., and Wheeler, G. 1980-81 Evaluation Bilingual Education Program. Clovis, New Mexico, 1981.

Schroeder, A. B., Wheeler, G., and Tafoya, C. A Process Model Evaluation of a Bilingual Education Program. Arlington, Va.: Computer Microfilm International, Corp., 1981. (Eric Document Reproduction Service No. ED 209 300)

Wheeler, G. and others. Evaluation of a Dual Bilingual Program: English-Spanish and English-Southeast Asian Languages. Arlington, Va.: Computer Microfilm International, Corp., 1982. (Eric Document Reproduction Service No. ED 223 651)

Willemsen, E. W. Understanding the Statistical Reasoning. San Francisco: W. E. Freeman, 1974.

Williams, F. Reasoning with Statistics (Second Edition) New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1979.

WORKSHOPS

August, 1982 Ida Carillo
Cultural Awareness Bilingual Assistance Center Workshop

October, 1982 Mela Ledger
Cultural Awareness Bilingual Assistance Center Workshop

December, 1982 Ida Carillo
Cultural Awareness Bilingual Assistance Center Workshop

February, 1983 Margaret Fernandez
Cultural Awareness Bilingual Assistance Center Workshop

March, 1983
"La Víctima"
Teatro De La Esperanza from Los Angeles, California

April, 1983
Selected staff attended the XIII Annual Conference of the New Mexico Association for Bilingual Education in Albuquerque

July, 1983
English-as-a-Second Language Workshop for parents of Southeast Asian children conducted by Ron West and assisted by K. Nilpirome

TITLE VII PROJECT
STAFF
1982-1983

SCHOOL	PRINCIPAL	TEACHERS	AIDES	TARGET	LEVEL
James Bickley	Elaine Ory	R. West	K. Nilpirome	Lao	K-6
Lincoln Jackson	B. J. Pierce		R. Baca	Spanish	K-6
Our Lady of Guadalupe	Frances Vogel	Erlinda Esquibel	L. Esquibel	Spanish	K-3
Sacred Heart	Sr. Cordia		C. Vongchanh	Lao	K-6